

100 Clearview Drive, Houghton Lake, Michigan

State Assessors Board Phone Number – (517) 373-8320

CALL TO ORDER: The meeting was called to order at 9:00 a.m., July 17, 2006, in a Conference Room, at the Educational Conference of the Michigan Association of Equalization Directors in Houghton Lake, Michigan.

[illegible]

Others Present: Gregory Pitoniak, Deputy State Treasurer
Frank Fisher, Colon Township Supervisor
Marie Fisher, Colon Township Assessor
Judy Nelson, St. Joseph Co. Equal. Dir.
Emilie Sharland, Plymouth, Michigan
Richard Sharland, Plymouth, Michigan
Marlene Whetstone, Wexford Co. Equal. Dir.

APPROVAL OF MINUTES:

The minutes of June 23, 2006, State Assessors Board meeting were reviewed by each Board Member prior to the meeting. Motion by Patel to approve the minutes as received. The motion was seconded by Morgan and unanimously approved. The minutes of the April 21, 2006, State Assessors Board meeting were reviewed and amended. Motion by Patel was seconded by Morgan and unanimously approved.

PUBLIC COMMENT:

Comments were made regarding revocation petitions 05-0002 and 05-0003.

A letter of apology addressed to the Board by Judy Nelson for an error made when testifying in a revocation case was read into the record.

Frank and Marie Fisher left the meeting.

FINANCIAL REPORT:

Motion by Hobart to receive and file the financial report with a May 31, 2006, balance of \$433,956.72. The fiscal year projections are as follows: Income \$350,000.00, Expenses \$325,000.00, Carryover (rounded) at the end of the fiscal year \$250,000.00. The motion was seconded by Patel and unanimously approved.

EDUCATIONAL PROGRAMS:

- 1) Motion by Patel, seconded by Hobart, and a unanimous vote to approve the following requests (items a-e) for continuing education for assessor certification:
 - a) 6 hours for Eight Steps of the Income Approach to Value by the Livingston County Assessors Association and the Tri-County Assessors Association on August 28, 2006, in Howell
 - b) 6 hours for Michigan Real Estate Continuing Education Course 700 by The Institute – The Source for Continuing Education, LLC, on March 27, 2006, in Newberry
 - c) 6 hours for REA 516 – An Appraiser’s Scope of Work by Oakland University
 - d) 6 hours for Online Appraisal of Nursing Facilities by the Appraisal Institute on June 28, 2006, in Chicago
 - e) 6 hours for Appraisal for Ad Valorem Taxation by the National Tax Association and Wichita State University on July 23-27, 2006, in Wichita
- 2) This item was discussed later in the meeting.
- 3) This item was discussed later in the meeting.
- 4) This item was discussed later in the meeting.
- 5) Motion by Hobart to accept the grader’s recommendation for demonstration narrative appraisal report 196 (1st submission) and to provide a copy of the grader reports for each Board Member prior to a demonstration narrative appraisal report being brought to a meeting. Additionally, a copy of the demonstration narrative appraisal report is to be mailed to one Board Member for review prior to the meeting when the demonstration narrative appraisal report will be presented for grader approval. The motion was seconded by Patel and unanimously approved.

EDUCATIONAL PROGRAMS (cont.):

- 6) The Michigan Association of Equalization Directors (MAED) Educational Conference Schedule was distributed to the Board Members.
- 7) Motion by Hobart was seconded by Morgan to approve the letter and the Narrative Grading Committee's review of the subject property located at 35705 Beattie Drive, Sterling Heights, Michigan. The motion was unanimously approved.

OLD BUSINESS:

- 1) State Assessors Board travel expenses were discussed.
- 2) Motion by Morgan was seconded by Hobart to approve the June 23, 2006, Assessment Administration Compliance Committee meeting minutes. The motion was unanimously approved. The cover letter to be used with the Open-Book Exercise was distributed for later review.
- 3) The Memorandum of Understanding was reviewed. Motion by Patel was seconded by McClelland to table the discussion. The motion was unanimously approved.
- 4) Motion by McClelland was seconded by Patel to table discussion until all responses to the over 1.10 state equalization factor letters have been responded to. The motion was unanimously approved.
- 5) Motion by Patel was seconded by Morgan to approve the Revocation Hearing Procedure brochure prepared by Regina Blough. The motion was unanimously approved.
- 6) Motion by McClelland was seconded by Patel to table the matter of the assessor that is assessing state equalized values in excess of that allowed for the certification level held because there has been inadequate time allowed for a response from the certified person. The motion was unanimously approved.

NEW BUSINESS:

- 1) A review of the purchasing policy was discussed.
- 2) A copy of the State Assessors Board annual report was presented to the Board by the Executive Secretary. The report was delivered by Henry Allen to the meeting of the Michigan Association of Equalization Directors.

NEW BUSINESS (cont.):

Gregory Pitoniak left the meeting.

- 3) It was announced that the Narrative Grader's Workshop would be held in the afternoon at 1:30 p.m.
- 4) Correspondence from Frank LeTarte was reviewed. Motion by Hobart was seconded by Patel that the assessor certification would be reinstated upon proof of attendance of the required educational renewal programs and payment of the required fees and penalties. Certifications can be reinstated within a period of 2 years upon payment of the fees, penalty fees, and proof of the educational requirements having been met. All assessor files for persons no longer certified are to be kept on file at the State Assessors Board Office for a period of 5 years. The motion was unanimously approved.

CERTIFICATIONS:

- 1) Motion by McClelland to approve amendments to the certification list as shown below. The motion was seconded by Hobart and unanimously approved.

LEVEL 1

Brang, Daniel J.

Taylor, Valerie B.

Woodington, Becky

LEVEL 2

MacKenzie, Jeffrey S.

Templeton, Joseph B.

LEVEL 3

Dittmar, Michael P.

Singleton, Heather M.

CERTIFICATION TOTALS AS OF 07/05/2006:

LEVEL 1	664
LEVEL 2	965
LEVEL 3	880
LEVEL 4	<u>152</u>
TOTAL	2,661

REVOCATIONS (Open Meeting):

- 1) In reference to revocation petitions 05-0002 and 05-0003, motion by Hobart was seconded by Patel to do the following:

Suspend the certification in assessment administration registered as R-8568-2, for a period of 2 years during which time she must complete the following before applying to reinstate the certification in assessment administration:

- a) Not permitted to work in assessment administration for a period of 2 years
- b) Attend State Assessors Board Course 1 and Course 2 and successfully complete the examinations offered at the completion of the two courses
- c) Attend an approved Uniform Standards of Professional Appraisal Practice (USPAP) course and successfully complete the examination offered at the completion of the course
- d) Study all State Tax Commission Bulletins published since Proposal A
- e) Be interviewed by the State Assessors Board before certification can be reinstated

There was discussion pertaining to the 2-year clause in the motion. Following the discussion, the motion was adopted.

Judy Nelson, Emilie and Richard Sharland, and Marlene Whetstone left the meeting.

- 2) Motion by McClelland was seconded by Hobart to notify the assessor named in revocation petition 06-0009 of the existence of the revocation, hold the revocation in abeyance until such time that the certification may be reinstated, and then dismiss the revocation. The motion was unanimously approved.

REVOCATIONS (Closed Meeting):

According to the Freedom of Information Act, §15.243 (1) and the Open Meetings Act, §15.268 (h)

Motion by Hobart was seconded by Morgan to go into closed meeting to discuss revocations and to review closed meeting minutes. There was a roll call vote: Allen-yes, Hobart-yes, McClelland-yes, Morgan-yes, Patel-Yes. The motion was unanimously approved. The following matters were discussed:

- 1) Revocation petition 06-0007 and 06-0019
- 2) Revocation petition 06-0020

REVOCATIONS (Closed Meeting) (cont.):

- 3) Revocation petition 05-0015
- 4) Revocation petition 06-0017
- 5) Closed meeting minutes of June 23, 2006

Motion by Hobart was seconded by Morgan to return to open meeting. There was a roll call vote: Allen-yes, Hobart-yes, McClelland-yes, Morgan-yes, Patel-Yes. The motion was unanimously approved.

REVOCATIONS (Open Meeting):

- 1) Motion by Hobart was seconded by Patel to refer revocation petitions 06-0007 and 06-0019 to the State Tax Commission to investigate the allegations and to specifically look at all parcel uncappings in the two townships involved. The motion was unanimously approved.
- 2) Motion by Hobart was seconded by Patel to dismiss revocation petition 06-0020 because it is not under the jurisdiction of the State Assessors Board. The motion was unanimously approved.
- 3) Motion by Hobart was seconded by McClelland to dismiss revocation petition 05-0015 because revocation was not warranted. The motion was unanimously approved.
- 4) Motion by Hobart was seconded by Patel to ask the assessor named in revocation petition 06-0017 to answer the allegations in writing. The motion was unanimously approved.

Motion by Patel was seconded by McClelland to recess the meeting until 9:00 a.m. on July 18, 2006. The motion was unanimously approved.

RECONVENING OF MEETING:

The meeting reconvened at 9:00 a.m. on July 18, 2006.

Members Present:	Henry O. Allen, Chairperson
	Lisa A. Hobart, Vice Chairperson
	Maxine J. McClelland, Member
	Frederick W. Morgan, Member
	Raman A. Patel, Member
	Joan E. Peoples, Executive Secretary

EDUCATIONAL PROGRAMS:

Motion by Patel, seconded by Hobart, and a unanimous vote to approve items 2-4 under Educational Programs on the agenda, which are the following:

- 2) Review of State Assessors Board educational renewal program evaluations.
- 3) Granting the 5-year Uniform Standards of Professional Appraisal Practice (USPAP) credit for either the current or the next 5-year period for USPAP courses offered at the 2006 MAA Schools offered after September 30, 2006.
- 4) Correspondence from a county equalization director working toward completion of the level 4 process.

APPROVAL OF MINUTES:

- 1) Motion by Hobart to approve the minutes of the closed meeting held on June 23, 2006. The motion was seconded by Morgan and unanimously approved.
- 2) Motion by Patel was seconded by Morgan to rescind the motion earlier in this meeting to amend the minutes of the April 21, 2006, State Assessors Board meeting. The motion was unanimously approved.
- 3) Motion by Patel was seconded by Morgan to amend the minutes of the April 21, 2006, State Assessors Board meeting as follows:

Page 6, item 6 is amended to read, "Motion by Morgan to dismiss revocation petition 05-0017 with a warning to work with the State Tax Commission in the future. The motion was seconded by Hobart and unanimously approved."

The motion to amend the minutes as shown was unanimously approved.

ASSESSMENT ADMINISTRATION COMPLIANCE COMMITTEE:

- 1) The Open-Book Exercise cover letter was reviewed along with all of the committee member comments. Motion by Patel was seconded by Morgan to approve the letter as amended. The motion was unanimously approved.
- 2) Motion by Patel was seconded by Hobart to ask Kelli Sobel, Executive Secretary of the State Tax Commission, to be a member of the Assessment Administration Compliance Committee. The motion was unanimously approved.

REVOCATIONS (Open Meeting):

- 1) Motion by Hobart was seconded by Morgan to notify an assessor when a petition is received by the State Assessors Board office to revoke their certification in assessment administration, to send a copy of the petition that was received with the notification to the assessor named in the petition. The only exception to this is if the petitioner states that they are in fear of their safety because of the assessor's actions then the State Assessors Board will be so warned. The motion was approved.
- 2) Motion by Hobart was seconded by Patel to notify the assessors named in revocation petitions contained in this agenda of the existence of a revocation when the revocations were dismissed. The motion was unanimously approved.

ANNOUNCEMENTS:

The next meeting of the State Assessors Board is scheduled for August 7 & 8, 2006, at the Educational Conference of the Michigan Assessors Association, at the Crystal Mountain Conference Center located in Thompsonville, Michigan.

ADJOURNMENT:

Motion by McClelland to adjourn the meeting at 10:20 a.m. The motion was seconded by Morgan and unanimously approved.

Respectfully submitted,

Henry O. Allen, Chairperson

Joan E. Peoples, Executive Secretary